

NINETEEN REPORTS, NINETEEN REASONS AND ONE HUNDRED SEVENTY-EIGHT FOOTNOTES WHY BALLOT MARKING DEVICES (BMDs) ARE A BAD TECHNOLOGY IF YOU'RE CONCERNED WITH ELECTION INTEGRITY

FALLACY #1: BMDs ARE PREFERRABLE TO HAND-MARKED PAPER BALLOTS.

"There is no realistic mechanism to fully secure vote casting and tabulation voting systems from cyber threats."

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine; Securing the Vote: Protecting American Democracy (2018)

https://www.nap.edu/catalog/25120/securing-the-vote-protecting-american-democracy1

<u>Curling v. Raffensperger lawsuit demanding, among other steps, that Georgia cease using BMDs and move to hand-marked paper ballots (October 2020)</u>

https://georgiarecorder.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/CurlingVRaffensperger.pdf²

J. Alex Halderman Declaration in Curling vs Raffensperger Georgia lawsuit affirming the vulnerabilities of BMDs vs. hand-marked paper ballots (August 2021)

https://tennesseeelectionintegrity.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/Halderman-Rebuttal-080221.pdf³

The Only Safe Means of Voting is Hand-Marked Paper Ballots (June 2020)
https://www.nccivitas.org/2020/safe-means-voting-hand-marked-paper-ballots/4

Expert Opinions on Electronic Ballot Marking Devices (BMD) Security (VoterGA)(2023) https://voterga.files.wordpress.com/2019/03/expert-security-opinions.pdf⁵

<u>Security Analysis of the Dominion ImageCast X BMD (Alex Halderman report unsealed in Georgia)(2023)</u> https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2023/06/14/security-analysis-of-the-dominion-imagecast-x/⁶

— <u>BMDs can be hacked, mis-programmed, misconfigured, or contain malware which alters the ballot or tallies.</u>

<u>Can Voters Detect Malicious Manipulation of Ballot Marking Devices? (May 2020)</u> <u>https://jhalderm.com/pub/papers/bmd-verifiability-sp20.pdf⁷</u>

¹ https://www.nap.edu/catalog/25120/securing-the-vote-protecting-american-democracy

² https://georgiarecorder.com/wwp-content/uploads/2021/08/CurlingVRaffensperger.pdf

³ https://tennesseeelectionintegrity.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/Halderman-Rebuttal-080221.pdf

⁴ https://www.nccivitas.org/2020/safe-means-voting-hand-marked-paper-ballots/

⁵ https://voterga.files.wordpress.com/2019/03/expert-security-opinions.pdf

⁶ https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2023/06/14/security-analysis-of-the-dominion-imagecast-x/

⁷ https://jhalderm.com/pub/papers/bmd-verifiability-sp20.pdf

Ballot Marking Devices Cannot Assure the Will of the Voters (April 2019) https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballot-

marking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters⁸

There is No Reliable Way to Detect Hacked Ballot-Marking Devices (August 2019) https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf9

It's Still Practically Impossible to Secure Your Computer or Voting Machine Against Attackers Who Have 30 Minutes of Access (August 2021)

https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2021/08/13/its-still-practically-impossible-to-secure-your-computer-orvoting-machine-against-attackers-who-have-30-minutes-of-access/10

Magical thinking about Ballot-Marking-Device contingency plans https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2022/07/21/magical-thinking-about-ballot-marking-device-contingencyplans/11

BMD touchscreens can be mis-calibrated causing "vote flipping."

Reliability of Pricey New Voting Machines Questioned (February 2020) https://apnews.com/article/ae388fb69d14e5d3619128a591cdc0c4¹²

Ballot Marking Devices Cannot Assure the Will of the Voters (April 2019) https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballotmarking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters¹³

There is No Reliable Way to Detect Hacked Ballot-Marking Devices (August 2019) https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf14

— BMDs are less auditable and less secure than paper ballots.

Guess Which Ballot Costs Less and is More Secure Paper or Electronic? (August 2019) https://www.pennlive.com/opinion/2019/08/quess-which-ballot-costs-less-and-is-more-secure-paperor-electronic-opinion.html¹⁵

⁸ https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballotmarking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters

https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf

¹⁰ https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2021/08/13/its-still-practically-impossible-to-secure-your-computer-or-votingmachine-against-attackers-who-have-30-minutes-of-access/

¹¹ https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2022/07/21/magical-thinking-about-ballot-marking-device-contingency-plans/

¹² https://apnews.com/article/ae388fb69d14e5d3619128a591cdc0c4

¹³ https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballotmarking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf

<u>Ballot Marking Devices Cannot Assure the Will of the Voters (April 2019)</u> <u>https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballot-</u> marking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters¹⁶

There is No Reliable Way to Detect Hacked Ballot-Marking Devices (August 2019) https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf¹⁷

<u>It's Still Practically Impossible to Secure Your Computer or Voting Machine Against Attackers Who Have</u> 30 Minutes of Access (August 2021)

https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2021/08/13/its-still-practically-impossible-to-secure-your-computer-or-voting-machine-against-attackers-who-have-30-minutes-of-access/18

Reliability of BMDs relies on voters detecting error on their ballot, yet only 5%-7% of voters find and report errors.

<u>Can Voters Detect Malicious Manipulation of Ballot Marking Devices? (May 2020)</u> <u>https://jhalderm.com/pub/papers/bmd-verifiability-sp20.pdf¹⁹</u>

What Voters Are Asked to Verify Affects Ballot Verification: A Quantitative Analysis of Voters' Memories of Their Ballots (December 2018)

https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3292208²⁰

J. Alex Halderman Declaration in Curling vs Raffensperger Georgia lawsuit affirming the vulnerabilities of BMDs vs. hand-marked paper ballots (August 2021)

https://tennesseeelectionintegrity.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/Halderman-Rebuttal-080221.pdf²¹

Today's Electronic Voting Machines

https://freespeechforpeople.org/todays-electronic-voting-machines/22

 $^{{}^{15}\,\}underline{https://www.pennlive.com/opinion/2019/08/guess-which-ballot-costs-less-and-is-more-secure-paper-or-electronic-opinion.html}$

¹⁶ https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177_Ballot-marking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters

¹⁷ https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf

¹⁸ https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2021/08/13/its-still-practically-impossible-to-secure-your-computer-or-voting-machine-against-attackers-who-have-30-minutes-of-access/

¹⁹ https://jhalderm.com/pub/papers/bmd-verifiability-sp20.pdf

²⁰ https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3292208

²¹ <u>https://tennesseeelectionintegrity.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/Halderman-Rebuttal-080221.pdf</u>

²² https://freespeechforpeople.org/todays-electronic-voting-machines/

—Only hand marked ballots are software-independent, contestable, and defensible.

Ballot Marking Devices Cannot Assure the Will of the Voters (April 2019) https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballotmarking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters²³

There is No Reliable Way to Detect Hacked Ballot-Marking Devices (August 2019) https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf²⁴

It's Still Practically Impossible to Secure Your Computer or Voting Machine Against Attackers Who Have 30 Minutes of Access (August 2021)

https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2021/08/13/its-still-practically-impossible-to-secure-your-computer-orvoting-machine-against-attackers-who-have-30-minutes-of-access/25

-BMDs can show one thing on the screen, but print something different on paper (votes can be changed or deleted).

There is No Reliable Way to Detect Hacked Ballot-Marking Devices (August 2019) https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf26

Ballot Marking Devices Cannot Assure the Will of the Voters (April 2019) https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballotmarking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters²⁷

Testing Cannot Tell Whether Ballot Marking Devices Alter Elections (August 2020) https://www.stat.berkelev.edu/~stark/Seminars/bmd-p-talk-20.slides.pdf²⁸

BMD accuracy cannot be confirmed by testing or audit.

They may look and look, yet not see: BMDs cannot be tested adequately (July 2022) https://tennesseeelectionintegrity.com/bmd-research-report-phillip-stark-072522/29

²³ https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballotmarking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf

²⁵ https://freedom-to-tinker.com/2021/08/13/its-still-practically-impossible-to-secure-your-computer-or-votingmachine-against-attackers-who-have-30-minutes-of-access/

²⁶ https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf

²⁷ https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballotmarking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters

https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Seminars/bmd-p-talk-20.slides.pdf

²⁹ https://tennesseeelectionintegrity.com/bmd-research-report-phillip-stark-072522/

Ballot Marking Devices Cannot Assure the Will of the Voters (April 2019) https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballotmarking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters³⁰

There is No Reliable Way to Detect Hacked Ballot-Marking Devices (August 2019) https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf31

BMD pretests are not reliable because the BMDs can be hacked with target time set for voting hours only.

There is No Reliable Way to Detect Hacked Ballot-Marking Devices (August 2019) https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf³²

FALLACY #2: BMDs REDUCE POLLING PLACE LINES, MAKE THE VOTE PROCESS MORE EFFICIENT.

BMDs actually produce longer lines.

Guess Which Ballot Costs Less and is More Secure Paper or Electronic? (August 2019) https://www.pennlive.com/opinion/2019/08/quess-which-ballot-costs-less-and-is-more-secure-paper-<u>or-electronic-opi</u>nion.html³³

— <u>Using BMDs takes voters 3x longer than using paper ballots.</u>

Reliability of Pricey New Voting Machines Questioned (February 2020) https://apnews.com/article/ae388fb69d14e5d3619128a591cdc0c4³⁴

BMDs can fail

Reliability of Pricey New Voting Machines Questioned (February 2020) https://apnews.com/article/ae388fb69d14e5d3619128a591cdc0c4³⁵

J. Alex Halderman Declaration in Curling vs Raffensperger Georgia lawsuit affirming the vulnerabilities of BMDs vs. hand-marked paper ballots (August 2021)

https://tennesseeelectionintegrity.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/Halderman-Rebuttal-080221.pdf³⁶

³⁰ https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333245177 Ballotmarking devices BMDs cannot assure the will of the voters

https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf
 https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Preprints/bmd-p19.pdf

³³ https://www.pennlive.com/opinion/2019/08/guess-which-ballot-costs-less-and-is-more-secure-paper-orelectronic-opinion.html

³⁴ https://apnews.com/article/ae388fb69d14e5d3619128a591cdc0c4

³⁵ https://apnews.com/article/ae388fb69d14e5d3619128a591cdc0c4

³⁶ https://tennesseeelectionintegrity.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/Halderman-Rebuttal-080221.pdf

— <u>BMDs have a history of not functioning correctly, for example, in Northampton, PA, Los Angeles, CA, and in GA.</u>

<u>Testing Cannot Tell Whether Ballot Marking Devices Alter Elections (August 2020)</u> <u>https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Seminars/bmd-p-talk-20.slides.pdf³⁷</u>

<u>A Pennsylvania County's Election Day Nightmare Underscores Voting Machine Concerns (November</u> 2019)

https://www.nytimes.com/2019/11/30/us/politics/pennsylvania-voting-machines.html38

FALLACY #3: BMDs ARE LESS EXPENSIVE THAN PAPER BALLOTS.

BMDs cost 2x the amount per voter as Hand Marked Paper Ballots.

<u>Guess Which Ballot Costs Less and is More Secure Paper or Electronic? (August 2019)</u>
https://www.pennlive.com/opinion/2019/08/guess-which-ballot-costs-less-and-is-more-secure-paper-or-electronic-opinion.html³⁹

— More money spent on IT staff at local level when BMDs are used.

<u>Voting Machines at Risk: Where We Stand Today (March 2019)</u> <u>https://www.brennancenter.org/our-work/research-reports/voting-machines-risk-where-we-stand-today</u>⁴⁰

###

³⁷ https://www.stat.berkeley.edu/~stark/Seminars/bmd-p-talk-20.slides.pdf

³⁸ https://www.nytimes.com/2019/11/30/us/politics/pennsylvania-voting-machines.html

³⁹ https://www.pennlive.com/opinion/2019/08/guess-which-ballot-costs-less-and-is-more-secure-paper-or-electronic-opinion.html

⁴⁰ https://www.brennancenter.org/our-work/research-reports/voting-machines-risk-where-we-stand-today